



FAYETTEVILLE FIRST

**Benchmark Research**  
**2016**



## Benchmark Research

Five cities were chosen as benchmark locations based on their population size and overall demographic characteristics, presence of a university, as well as the entrepreneurial and arts/cultural atmosphere. Those cities are Asheville, North Carolina; Boulder, Colorado; Chapel Hill, North Carolina; Fort Collins, Colorado; and Lawrence, Kansas. Below is demographic information on each of these cities, plus Fayetteville.

	Fayetteville	Asheville	Boulder	Chapel Hill	Fort Collins	Lawrence	U.S.
2015 Population	81,167	89,426	101,990	60,309	152,502	87,643	318,536,439
2015 – 2020 Annual Population Growth Rate	1.97%	1.37%	0.96%	1.13%	1.19%	0.67%	0.75%
2010 Square Miles	53.85	44.93	24.66	21.12	54.28	33.56	N/A
2010 Population Density	1,366.4	1,855.9	3,948.3	2,710.0	2,652.8	2,611.2	N/A
Median Age	28.4	39.3	29.4	26.7	30.7	27.7	37.9
<b>Educational Attainment</b>							
Associate's Degree (%)	5.07%	7.62%	3.80%	4.20%	8.47%	5.74%	8.17%
Bachelor's Degree (%)	24.84%	27.81%	34.57%	28.39%	31.03%	28.82%	18.64%
Graduate/Professional Degree (%)	19.64%	17.44%	37.97%	47.07%	21.36%	26.67%	11.39%
<b>Total Associate's Degree or Higher</b>	<b>49.55%</b>	<b>52.87%</b>	<b>76.34%</b>	<b>79.66%</b>	<b>60.86%</b>	<b>61.23%</b>	<b>38.20%</b>
<b>Income</b>							
Per Capita Income	\$24,597	\$26,290	\$36,252	\$36,276	\$31,131	\$25,768	\$28,597
Average Household Income	\$56,412	\$58,442	\$81,501	\$96,885	\$74,108	\$61,954	\$74,699
Median Household Income	\$37,313	\$39,257	\$52,045	\$52,221	\$55,173	\$44,993	\$53,217
Poverty Rate Total Population	24.9	20.5	13.9	23.7	18.6	23.1	15.2
Poverty Rate Excluding Off-Campus College Student	17.1	19.1	10.1	12.2	11.0	11.4	14.5
<b>Cost of Living</b>							
Overall	91	102	155	128	113	96	100
Grocery	88.5	103.7	98.3	102	100.7	91.4	100
Health	92	104	103	102	104	89	100
Housing	95	103	277	183	145	99	100
Utilities	89	109	92	88	91	89	100
Transportation	89	97	98	99	96	96	100
Miscellaneous	89	101	97	108	98	100	100

Source: Esri, Business Analyst, Sperlings Best Places, FBI Uniform Crime Report, U.S. Census



As shown above, the population of Fayetteville is very similar to Asheville and Lawrence. Fort Collins has the largest population at 152,502 followed by Boulder at 101,990, and Chapel Hill has the smallest. Fort Collins is also the largest in terms of square miles.

All locations have projected population growth from 2015 to 2020 with Fayetteville having the highest. When compared to the U.S. all cities have a higher projected population growth over the next five years with the exception of Lawrence.

Due to all locations but one being a “university town,” the median age of all is fairly young, with Asheville having the highest at 39.3. Asheville is also the only city with a median age higher than the U.S. at 37.9.

On a similar note, all locations have a high percentage of population with an Associate’s Degree or higher with Fayetteville having the lowest and Chapel Hill having the highest at nearly 80 percent. In the U.S., 38.2 percent of the population hold an Associate’s Degree or higher, which is lower than all locations.

Related to income, Chapel Hill and Boulder have the highest per capita income, and Fayetteville has the lowest. Boulder, Chapel Hill and Fort Collins all have a higher per capita income than the U.S. When looking at the poverty rate for the total population, Fayetteville has the highest at 24.9 percent followed by Asheville at 20.5 percent. However, when the off-campus college students are excluded from those numbers, Asheville has the highest poverty rate at 19.1 percent followed by Fayetteville at 17.1 percent. The U.S. poverty rate without off-campus students is lower than both Asheville and Fayetteville at 14.5 percent.

Fayetteville has the lowest cost of living of all locations and Boulder has the highest.



## FAYETTEVILLE, ARKANSAS

Fayetteville has an estimated 2015 population of 81,167 with an annual growth rate of 1.97 percent over the next five years. Per capita income for Fayetteville residents is \$24,597. Median age is 28.4. For residents over the age of 25, 49.55 percent hold an associate’s degree or higher. The University of Arkansas is located in Fayetteville and has an estimated enrollment of 26,000.

### Organizational Staffing and Structure

The City of Fayetteville’s economic development services are managed by the city development services director. This department serves as a liaison of the city to the Fayetteville Chamber of Commerce (Chamber) who contracts with the city to provide economic development services. The Chamber staff includes a President and CEO, Director of Economic Development and Sustainability and Economic Development Specialist. <sup>1</sup>

### Budget

The City of Fayetteville’s contract with the Chamber is for \$165,000 annually.

### Metrics

The Chamber provides monthly reports to the city on business attraction activity; business retention and expansion; entrepreneurship; and infrastructure.

### Entrepreneurship

#### *Arkansas Research & Technology Park*

The Arkansas Research & Technology Park (ARTP) has the mission to stimulate a knowledge-based economy in Arkansas through partnerships. Corporate partners of ARTP have access to talent and technology through the faculty and facilities at the U of A. <sup>2</sup> ARTP consists of two campuses providing support for research and development as well as assembly manufacturing. There are approximately 34 public/private affiliates of the ARTP. <sup>3</sup>

TARGETS

KNOWLEDGE ECONOMY

MEDICAL & HEALTHCARE  
SECTOR

ARTS & CULTURE/CREATIVE  
ECONOMY

EXPERIENCE ECONOMY

CLEAN & HIGH TECHNOLOGY

NATIONAL & REGIONAL  
HEADQUARTERS



### *Startup Junkie Consulting*

Located on the Fayetteville Square, Startup Junkie Consulting supports small businesses and startups in the following industries: retail, consumer packaged goods, supply chain, food and data analytics. Support offered by Startup Junkie includes mentorships, networking and educational programming as well as facilitating capital access with banks, alternative lenders, venture capital and angel groups. <sup>4</sup>

### *Hayseed Ventures*

Hayseed Ventures is described as a company that turns “startups into businesses.” <sup>5</sup> Hayseed Ventures works with early stage startups to refine their initial concepts in order to build a minimum viable product and provide support through series A funding. Areas of expertise for Hayseed Ventures are customer acquisition and conversion; development and web design; design and branding; and business strategy and data analysis. <sup>6</sup>

### *Northwest Arkansas Innovation Hub*

It was announced in the summer of 2015 that the Northwest Arkansas Innovation Hub would be established on the Fayetteville Square, spearheaded by the Fayetteville Chamber. The Innovation Hub is meant to be a space that enables innovators and entrepreneurs and will include a maker space or Fab Lab, which will house “maker” machinery and equipment for invention and prototyping, including a CNC Routing Table, 3D printers and laser-cutting tools catering to entrepreneurs and startup companies, as well as artists and designers. <sup>7</sup>

## **Sustainability**

### *STAR Community*

In August of 2014, the City of Fayetteville received recognition as a 3-STAR community. STAR Communities is a nonprofit organization that evaluates and certifies sustainable communities. <sup>8</sup>

## Notable Successes

### **2016**

3<sup>RD</sup> BEST PLACE TO LIVE – *U.S. NEWS AND WORLD REPORT*

6<sup>TH</sup> BEST CITY FOR WORKING STUDENTS – *SMARTASSET.COM*

### **2015**

3<sup>RD</sup> BEST CITY TO FOUND A COMPANY OUTSIDE OF SILICON VALLEY & NEW YORK – *DATAFOX*

4<sup>TH</sup> BEST COLLEGE TOWN IN THE NATION – *LIVIABILITY.COM*

BEST COLLEGE TOWN IN THE SEC – *LIVIABILITY.COM*

23<sup>RD</sup> BEST PLACE FOR BUSINESS AND CAREERS – *FORBES*

UNIVERSITY OF ARKANSAS WALTON COLLEGE NAMED TO TOP 100 BEST BUSINESS SCHOOLS – *U.S. NEWS AND WORLD REPORT*

### **2014**

TOP 10 BEST COLLEGE TOWNS – *LIVIABILITY.COM*



### *LEED Certification*

All civic buildings in the City of Fayetteville constructed after 2011 are required to be LEED Certified. The Fayetteville Public Library is LEED Certified.<sup>9</sup>

### *Weatherization and Efficiency in City Buildings*

The city plans to utilize utility bill management software to establish building and overall energy use baselines and track normalized changes as improvements are implemented. There are also plans to implement weatherization or efficiency projects for City buildings utilizing \$40,000 in CIP for Building Energy Efficiency.

### *Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE)*

Fayetteville's Energy Improvement District No 1 and Arkansas Advanced Equity Energy (A2E2) offer businesses in the city financing for energy efficiency upgrades through Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE). The city is also working with Fayetteville Energy Improvement District No 1 and Arkansas Advanced Equity Energy (A2E2) to advertise and grow Fayetteville's PACE Program and to expand PACE to other communities.

### *Solid Waste Reduction, Diversion and Recycling Master Plan*

The City of Fayetteville is working with the Recycling and Trash Division and community stakeholders to develop a master plan that will help the City move towards a goal of 80 percent waste diversion. Pilot projects are underway to determine effectiveness of types of recycling collection services and solid waste composting.

### *Green House Gas Mitigation*

The City of Fayetteville has plans to track and report community greenhouse gas emissions with a goal of achieving 80 percent reduction in community-wide greenhouse gas emissions.

### *Renewable Energy*

The city works with Ozarks Electric Cooperative and Southwestern Electric Power Company (SWEPCo) to identify and invest in renewable energy generation facilities as a way of stabilizing the City's energy costs, offsetting the City's Carbon Footprint and promoting market development.

### *Bicycle Friendliness*

Fayetteville is also pursuing recognition as a Bicycle Friendly Community with a goal of achieving a silver designation. In addition, the city is working with the U of A to develop a community bike share program.



*Smart Parking*

Currently a parking and mobility study is being conducted that will analyze parking inventory and utilization, as well as identify strategies to promote walkability and downtown redevelopment.

*Invasive Species*

The city also provides invasive species education and awareness to Fayetteville citizens and developers, and has an internal policy related to invasive species procurement and removal.



## ASHEVILLE, NORTH CAROLINA

Asheville has an estimated 2015 population of 89,426 with an annual population growth rate of 1.37 percent between 2015 and 2020. Per capita income in Asheville is \$26,290. The median age is 39.3. Of the population over 25 years of age more than 50 percent hold an Associates Degree or higher.<sup>10</sup> Asheville is also home to the University of North Carolina Asheville with an enrollment of 3,900.<sup>11</sup>

### Organizational Staffing and Structure

The City of Asheville Community and Economic Development department works in partnership with the Economic Development Coalition of Asheville-Buncombe County, part of the Asheville Chamber of Commerce.<sup>12</sup> The Community and Economic Development department includes nine staff members whose titles include Director; Assistant Director; Economic Development Specialist (2); Workforce Development Programs Coordinator; Administrative Assistant; Real Estate Coordinator; Riverfront Office Director; and Real Estate Manager.<sup>13</sup>

The Economic Development Coalition of Asheville-Buncombe County's team includes seven staff members. Those positions are Executive Director; Director of Business Development; Director of Research; Director of Business Retention; Director of Entrepreneurship Development; Communications and Marketing Manager; and Economic Development Coordinator.<sup>14</sup>

In 2015, the Asheville City Council voted to give the Economic Development Coalition \$100,000 for business recruitment and retention efforts.<sup>15</sup>

### Asheville Downtown Association

The Asheville Downtown Association (ADA) advocates for the vitality of downtown. The organization receives funding from members as well as events. ADA lists an executive director and membership and office manager as well as three staff members dedicated to events.<sup>16</sup>

TARGETS

ADVANCED MANUFACTURING

SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY

HEALTHCARE

ARTS & CULTURE

ENTREPRENEURSHIP





## Incentives

The City of Asheville provides Land Use Grant Incentives that provide property tax rebates to projects that fulfill public objectives outlined in the City Council's Strategic Plan. Those objectives include green building; affordable and workforce housing; and mixed-use and transit oriented projects. Qualifying for the grants require projects obtain Energy Star certification; consist of two or more dwelling units; and be located within city limits and ¼-mile of major highways. Green and affordable housing projects may also qualify for a 50 percent rebate of water connection fees.<sup>17</sup>

Industrial Development Grants are also available to eligible businesses investing \$1.5 million or more. Eligible companies would qualify for a grant paid annually calculated as a percentage of property taxes for up to seven years. In addition to the investment requirement, companies must be consistent with long-range plans and development goals; create "quality jobs;" and be engaged in eligible business activities that may include manufacturing, research and development or distribution.<sup>18</sup> This incentive also requires all new and retained jobs pay a living wage as determined by the universal living wage formula. A Business Development Grant is available for projects with an investment of more than \$250,000 but less than \$1.5 million.<sup>19</sup>

## Metrics

In 2010, Asheville began a five-year initiative to create 5,000 new jobs with an average annual wage of \$50,000 and \$500 million in capital investment within their five target clusters. Results were reported in 2015 that showed more 6,385 new jobs were created in the last year in addition to \$1 billion in capital investment.<sup>20</sup>

## Entrepreneurship

Venture Asheville is an initiative of the Economic Development Coalition of Asheville-Buncombe County and the Asheville Chamber of Commerce. Programs offered at Venture Asheville include Elevate, which provides mentorships, peer-to-peer advising, guest speakers, and online access to a network of 20,000 CEOs worldwide.<sup>21</sup> Asheville Angels a member-based angel investor network was launched in 2014 and currently has 50

## Notable Successes

### 2015

#10 BEST CITIES IN U.S. AND CANADA – *TRAVEL & LEISURE*  
 #2 BEST STARTUP CITY IN AMERICA – *POPULAR MECHANICS*  
 ONE OF THE BEST PLACES TO LIVE & WORK AS A MOVIE MAKER – *MOVIEMAKER MAGAZINE*

### 2014

NAMED UNEXPECTED SOURCE OF INNOVATION – *FORBES*  
 #8 SMARTEST CITIES IN THE SMALL SMART SET – *FORBES*  
 CALLED NEST GREEN TECH TOWN – *HUFFINGTON POST*  
 AMONG 10 COLLEGE TOWNS WITH BEST MUSIC SCENES – *MUSICSCHOOLCENTRAL.COM*  
 #12 BEST PLACES TO LIVE 2015 – *LIVABILITY.COM*

### 2013

BEST PLACES TO LIVE – *LIVABILITY.COM*  
 BEST BEER TOWNS – *CNN.COM*  
 BEST PLACES FOR BUSINESS AND CAREERS – *FORBES.COM*



members who have invested more than \$350,000 in six ventures.<sup>22</sup> Venture Asheville also hosts networking events including 1 Million Cups and Startup Grind.<sup>23</sup>

### **River Arts District**

The River Arts District is located along the French Broad River and includes artists working studios in 22 former industrial and historical buildings. With more than 200 artists working in the mile long district, visitors are encouraged to wear comfortable shoes and walk the area. In addition to studios there are also restaurants, cafes and a brewery in the district.<sup>24</sup>

### **Craft Beer**

It has been reported that Asheville is home to more breweries per capita than any other city in the U.S. In addition to small batch breweries, the area is also home to large operations including Sierra Nevada Brewing Company, Oskar Blues and New Belgium.<sup>25</sup> New Belgium will be locating in Asheville's River Arts District and will create 154 new jobs.<sup>26</sup>

To provide support for the industry and community support, Oskar Blues worked with the local community college to develop a brewing curriculum and offered space for use by students.<sup>27</sup>

### **Sustainability**

The City of Asheville's Office of Sustainability works across all departments to promote sustainable design and technology into city operations.<sup>28</sup> The City has a goal of reducing their carbon footprint by 80 percent by 2030, using a 2008 baseline.<sup>29</sup>

### **Tree Preservation**

The City of Asheville's Tree Commission is a nine-member appointed board that is administered by the director of the city's public works department. Responsibilities of the commission include preservation, planting, replacement and removal of trees, without denying the reasonable use and enjoyment of real property."<sup>30</sup>



**Permitting**

Construction projects of all sizes require a permit in Asheville. Permits and the associated approval process vary depending on the scope of the project. Residential improvements would qualify for a Stand-alone Permit but if installation requires more than one type of installation a Multi-trade Permit would be issued. Plumbing, electrical or mechanical projects that do not require a plan can often receive a permit on the same day it is requested. Asheville uses the following table to estimate timing for review of plans.

PLAN REVIEW TIMEFRAMES								
	Building	Fire Prevention	Addressing	Zoning	Driveway	Grading Erosion	Stormwater	Flood
<b>Residential Waiver</b>	1-3 Working Days	-----	1-3 Working Days	1-3 Working Days	1-3 Working Days	1-3 Working Days	-----	1-3 Working Days
<b>Residential</b>	10 Working Days	-----	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	-----	10 Working Days
<b>Quick Touch</b>	1-3 Working Days	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----
<b>Temp Use/ Events</b>	10 Days	10 Days	-----	10 Days	-----	-----	-----	-----
<b>Public Interest Events</b> involving congregation of 100 people or more	21 Days	21 Days Minimum	-----	21 Days	-----	-----	-----	-----
<b>Small Commercial</b>	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	10 Working Days	-----	10 Working Days
<b>Standard Commercial</b>	(Level 1) 21 Days	21 Days	10 Working Days	Varies	10 Working Days	30 Days	30 Days	30 Days
	(Level 2 & 3) 30-45 Days	30-45 Days						
<b>Large Commercial</b>	90 Days	90 Days	10 Working Days	Varies	10 Working Days	30 Days	30 Days	30 Days



## BOULDER, COLORADO

Boulder has a population of 101,900 and a projected annual population growth rate of 0.96 percent between 2015 and 2020. The median age is 29.4. Per capita income for Boulder residents is \$36,252. More than three-quarters of the population over the age of 25 hold an Associates Degree or higher.<sup>31</sup> The University of Colorado is located in Boulder and has an enrollment of more than 30,000.<sup>32</sup>

### Organizational Staffing and Structure

The City of Boulder has established an Economic Vitality program to reinforce the importance of economic health as part of overall quality of life and demonstrate support of business and economic sustainability with a focus on innovation and entrepreneurship. The Economic Vitality program also handles business retention.<sup>33</sup> The program is administered by two staff members, including an Economic Vitality Coordinator and a Business Liaison.<sup>34</sup>

The Boulder Economic Council is the economic development function of the Boulder Chamber and has three staff members including an Executive Director, Economic Development Manager and a Project and Event Coordinator.<sup>35</sup>

The City of Boulder makes a \$20,000 annual contribution to the Boulder Chamber.<sup>36</sup>

### Downtown Boulder, Inc.

Downtown Boulder, Inc. is contracted by the Downtown Boulder Business Improvement District to organize and produce events downtown. Downtown Boulder, Inc. also receives funding from memberships and event revenue.<sup>37</sup>

### Incentives

The City of Boulder offers companies looking to expand in the city a rebate of building permit taxes and fees. This incentive is offered through the Economic Vitality Program and has an annual budget of \$350,000.<sup>38</sup>

### Metrics

Metrics were not reported on either the City of Boulder or the Boulder Economic Council's website.

TARGETS

AEROSPACE

BIOSCIENCE

CLEANTECH

IT/SOFTWARE

NATURAL PRODUCTS

OUTDOOR RECREATION



## Entrepreneurship

Boulder has a reputation as one of the hottest start-up communities in the U.S. The University of Colorado (CU) is considered one of the nation's leading entrepreneurial public universities and is home to the Silicon Flatirons Center, an interdisciplinary research center for law, technology and entrepreneurship. Programs of the center include the CU New Venture Challenge, a pitch competition, Crash Course Series, Entrepreneurial Law Clinic, Entrepreneurship Certificate as well as roundtable series on entrepreneurship, innovation and public policy.<sup>39</sup>

Boulder is also home to TechStars, which is considered one of the leading start-up accelerators in the world. The center has worked with more than 700 companies and provided more than \$2 billion in funding.<sup>40</sup>

Other entrepreneur resources in Boulder include accelerators, virtual business incubators and co-working spaces.<sup>41</sup>

To promote entrepreneurship, the Boulder Microloan Program provides funding of up to \$50,000 to businesses with annual gross revenue of less than \$2 million.<sup>42</sup>

Spark Boulder is a co-working space for entrepreneurship that was designed and created by students. Spark is designed to provide a place for students to innovate new ideas, work in an environment dedicated to innovation, have access to professional services such as legal advice and mentorship and server services, including SDK's, Master Suite, monitors, Ipad's, Iphone's, and Android devices to give developers every tool they need to develop their projects.<sup>43</sup>

## Millennial Attraction/Retention

Boulder reported a four-year growth of the age 25 to 34-year-old population with college degrees at 20.0 percent. Due to investment from established companies such as Google and a vibrant startup scene, the city is one of the best examples of a high-growth, entrepreneurial community in the U.S. right now. The area's affordable cost of living costs and natural scenery makes it even more attractive to the millennial generation.<sup>44</sup>

### Notable Successes

#### 2015

4<sup>TH</sup> LEAST STRESSED CITY IN AMERICA – SMART ASSET

#### 2014

#1 IN WORKFORCE EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT – FORBES

#### 2013

METRO WITH HIGHEST HIGH-TECH START-UP DENSITY IN U.S. – KAUFFMAN FOUNDATION



The U.S. Census found that near 36 percent of Boulder-area millennials had a bachelor's degree or better in a 2009 to 2013 survey, which is well above the national average. And many of those students are finding opportunities locally, either after graduation or while they're still taking classes. The campus community even has a student-built coworking and incubator space, Spark Boulder discussed previously, which helps student entrepreneurs to find their footing.<sup>45</sup>

### **Sustainability**

The City of Boulder's Climate and Sustainability department has a goal of reducing local carbon emissions by 80 percent by 2050 with 2005 as a baseline.<sup>46</sup> Boulder is also working towards becoming a zero waste community. Property owners and businesses must provide recycling and compost collection containers for all occupants and tenants.<sup>47</sup>

### **Tree Preservation**

The Urban Forestry section of the city has the responsibility of providing development design review and enforcement of tree protection codes.<sup>48</sup>

### **Permitting**

The City of Boulder uses a phased process for the review of building permits. For small projects such as fences, roofs, single family electrical systems, and single family heating and air-conditioning systems, a permit may be issued over the counter. For new multi-family dwellings and commercial buildings the estimated review time is 60 days. If for any reason a permit is not granted within 180 days the applicant can either file an extension or will have to submit a new application.<sup>49</sup> An online permit status report allows an application to be tracked throughout the process.<sup>50</sup>



## CHAPEL HILL, NORTH CAROLINA

Chapel Hill has a population of 60,309 and a projected annual growth rate of 1.13 percent between 2015 and 2020. Per capita income is \$36,276 and the median age is 26.7. Among residents over the age of 25, nearly 80 percent hold an Associate’s Degree or higher.<sup>51</sup> The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill has an enrollment of nearly 30,000.<sup>52</sup>

### Organizational Staffing and Structure

Orange County Economic Development (OCED) provides a full range of economic development services to Chapel Hill. OCED also oversees the Chapel/Hill Orange County Visitors Bureau and is the county’s official Destination Marketing Organization.<sup>53</sup>

The OCED budget was more than \$1.4 million for fiscal year 2015-2016.<sup>54</sup>

The Town of Chapel Hill has an Economic Development department although there does not appear to be any dedicated staff members.<sup>55</sup>

Chapel Hill is also part of the 13-county Research Triangle Regional Partnership.

### Chapel Hill Downtown Partnership

The Chapel Hill Downtown Partnership is tasked with marketing and promoting the downtown area as well as rebuilding the area for mixed use retail, service, professional and residential. The organization has two staff members.<sup>56</sup>

### Entrepreneurship

The Orange County Small Business Loan Program is a revolving loan fund for companies with gross revenues of less than \$3 million annually.<sup>57</sup>

Innovate@Carolina is a campus-wide initiative of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill (UNC-Chapel Hill). The Cube at the Campus Y is a hub for social innovation and extends the mission of the Center for Social Justice at UNC-Chapel Hill.<sup>58</sup> Launch Chapel Hill is another university program that works to promote entrepreneurship in the area located downtown. The program includes a 22-week course for businesses with high-

**TARGETS (RESEARCH TRIANGLE)**

- ADVANCED MEDICAL CARE
- AGRICULTURAL BIOTECHNOLOGY
- ANALYTICAL INSTRUMENTATION
- BIOLOGICAL AGENTS AND INFECTIOUS DISEASES
- CLEANTECH
- DEFENSE TECHNOLOGIES
- INFORMATICS
- INTERACTIVE GAMING AND E-LEARNING
- NANOSCALE TECHNOLOGIES
- PERVASIVE COMPUTING
- PHARMACEUTICALS



growth potential. In addition to entrepreneurs-in-residence and resources, Launch Chapel Hill also has collaborative office space.<sup>59</sup> The University provides additional space for networking and co-location at the 1789 Venture Lab.<sup>60</sup>

### **Technology**

RENCI, Renaissance Computing Institute, develops technologies to enable research discoveries and applications. Using cyber tools and other technologies RENCi partners with both government agencies and industries focusing on medicine and genomics, environmental sciences and data management.<sup>61</sup>

### **Incentives**

The Orange County Economic Development Grant Program includes a Business Investment Grant funded by a one-quarter cent sales tax and managed by the County's Economic Development office. To support and encourage entrepreneurship, early stage development, local agriculture and local food systems, small and large grants are available ranging from up to \$1,500 and more than \$1,500 to \$10,000. An Agriculture Economic Development grant assists local farmers develop new sources of agricultural income.<sup>62</sup>

### **Arts and Culture**

The Chapel Hill Public and Cultural Arts Office provides students in the local school district opportunities to work with local artists and create original artwork for their schools and community through the Artists-in-Residence program.

The Downtown Art Program encourages local artists to apply to conduct a project in downtown Chapel Hill. All media and art forms are considered including performing arts, installations, and cultural or educational programming.

In 2002, the Percent for Art Program was passed in the form of a Town Ordinance. The program allocated one percent of selected capital project's construction budget for the creation and maintenance of public art.

### **Sustainability**

The Town of Chapel Hill has made several commitments to sustainability including a goal of reducing carbon emissions 60 percent by 2050 with 2005 as a baseline; purchase environmentally sensitive products; and ensure all Town buildings are examples of sustainable building practices.





## Permitting

The Town of Chapel Hill's permitting is handled through its Office of Planning and Sustainability.<sup>63</sup> The Office of Planning and Sustainability is touting permitting improvements in 2015, including:

- Simplified permit application
- Updated, easy-to-read checklist and associated materials
- Improved web presence: easier to access, added resources
- Implemented text message update service
- Improved building inspector availability
- Average commercial permit approval time approximately 15 days, 30 days for commercial.<sup>64</sup>



## FORT COLLINS, COLORADO

Fort Collins has a population of 152,502 and a projected annual population growth rate of 1.19 percent between 2015 and 2020. The median age for Fort Collins residents is 30.7 and per capita income is \$31,131. More than 60 percent of residents over the age of 25 have an Associate’s Degree or higher.<sup>65</sup> Colorado State University (CSU) is located in Fort Collins with an enrollment of more than 30,000 students.<sup>66</sup>

### Organizational Structure and Staffing

The City of Fort Collins has an Economic Health Office that includes a Director; Industry Cluster Coordinator and Economic Policy; and Project Manager.<sup>67</sup>

The Fort Collins Area Chamber of Commerce’s role in economic development is to focus on business retention and provide support to other groups in the region including the Colorado Clean Energy Cluster and the Larimer Biosciences Cluster.<sup>68</sup>

From 2001 until September of 2015 economic development in Fort Collins and Larimer County was handled by a public-private organization, Northern Colorado Economic Development Corporation (NCEDC). In October of 2015 the NCEDC board voted to merge with the Northern Colorado Economic Alliance.<sup>69</sup>

The Northern Colorado Economic Alliance is a 501(c)6 organization that provides the traditional economic development marketing in Larimer and Weld Counties. There are three staff members in the positions of Chief Executive Officer, Chief Operating Officer and Vice President Business Development.<sup>70</sup> The budget for the Northern Colorado Economic Alliance was \$650,000 in 2015.<sup>71</sup>

### Downtown Fort Collins Business Association

The Downtown Fort Collins Business Association focuses on promoting the businesses located downtown. The organization sells downtown gift cards annually in the amount of \$350,000.<sup>72</sup>

**TARGETS**

INNOVATION ECONOMY

BIOSCIENCE

CLEAN ENERGY

SOFTWARE/HARDWARE

UNIQUELY FORT COLLINS

WATER INNOVATION

NANOSCALE TECHNOLOGIES

PERVASIVE COMPUTING

PHARMACEUTICALS



## Incentives

The City of Fort Collins Economic Health Department provides grants to local companies operating within one of their industry clusters. Annual allocations for these grants are \$175,000 and applicants must find private funding to match any grants given by the city.<sup>73</sup>

## Metrics

The City of Fort Collins does not have any published metrics related to economic development.

## Entrepreneurship

Innosphere is Colorado's leading technology incubator and is located in Fort Collins. The incubator is focused on high-growth companies in software, biosciences and digital health. Funding partners of the incubator include the City of Fort Collins and CSU.<sup>74</sup> Programs and services offered include networking, mentors and a business launch program.<sup>75</sup>

CSU's Institute for Entrepreneurship offers a venture accelerator program and incubator with space for up to three companies.<sup>76</sup>

## Sustainability

Fort Collins has reduced its municipal carbon footprint by 12 percent between 2005 and 2014. The city has a goal of reducing their carbon footprint by 80 percent by 2030 and becoming carbon neutral by 2050.<sup>77</sup>

The City's Sustainability Services Area houses the departments of Economic Health, Environmental Services and Social Sustainability.<sup>78</sup>

## Tree Preservation

The City of Fort Collins has a forester whose duties include managing trees on city property, a tree mulch program and tree insect and disease notification. This department does not appear to have a role in the permitting and planning process.<sup>79</sup>

## Permitting

Building permits are required for all projects with a valuation of \$3,000 or more.<sup>80</sup> An application can be tracked via the Citizen Access Portal.<sup>81</sup> Applications for building permits are accepted during normal business hours without an appointment however; effective December 7, 2015 appointments are required for all project review submittals.<sup>82</sup>

## Notable Successes

2015

7<sup>TH</sup> LEAST STRESSED CITY IN AMERICA – SMART ASSET



## LAWRENCE, KANSAS

Lawrence has a population of 87,643 and a projected annual population growth rate of 0.67 percent between 2015 and 2020. The median age for Lawrence’s residents is 27.7 and per capita income is \$25,768. More than 61 percent of residents over the age of 25 have an Associate’s Degree or higher.<sup>83</sup> The University of Kansas is located in Lawrence with an enrollment of more than 28,000 students.<sup>84</sup>

### Organizational Staffing and Structure

The Economic Development Corporation of Lawrence and Douglas County provide economic development services including working as a liaison with local governmental agencies, assistance with identifying available incentives, providing current demographics information and tours of the region.<sup>85</sup> There are four staff members that are shared with The Chamber of Lawrence. The Chamber also works with the City of Lawrence, Douglas County and the Bioscience and Technology Business Center to promote economic development.

The City of Lawrence’s 2015 budget allocated \$219,500 to the Lawrence Chamber of Commerce; \$42,500 to Downtown Lawrence, Inc., and \$275,000 to the Bioscience and Technology Business Center.<sup>86</sup>

### Downtown Lawrence, Inc.

Downtown Lawrence, Inc. represents 180 business located downtown and has one staff member.<sup>87</sup>

### Incentives

The City of Lawrence offers the following incentives:

- Neighborhood Revitalization Area is for projects that promote the reinvestment and revitalization of properties that in turn have a positive economic effect upon a neighborhood and City in general.
- Transportation Development District provides funding for transportation related projects and/or infrastructure, above and beyond what the City would normally require.
- Community Improvement District (CID) can be used for public improvements in quality redevelopment & infill projects that promote economic development and tourism. CID funds can also be used for a portion of private improvements in infill projects that go above and beyond what the City would normally require.

TARGETS

BIOSCIENCE AND  
PHARMACEUTICALS

ANIMAL HEALTH

ADVANCED MANUFACTURING



- Tax Increment Financing support projects that provide a substantial and significant public benefit to the community.
- Tax Abatement supports expansion of existing or establishment of new business enterprise. Businesses primarily engaged in one or more Kansas Basic Industries including: agriculture; mining; manufacturing; interstate transportation; wholesale trade, financial services, or business providing services to out of own markets; research/development for new products, processes or technologies; tourism attracting out-of-state tourists.
- Industrial Revenue Bonds provide funding for projects that enhance Downtown Lawrence, promote infill, incorporate environmentally sustainable elements, provide other public benefits as per the Comprehensive Plan of Lawrence and Douglas County, projects that support target industries (life sciences/research, IT, aviation/aerospace, value-added agriculture, light manufacturing & distribution).<sup>88</sup>

### Notable Successes

#### **2014**

TOP 25 MOST IMPROVED CITIES – NERD WALLET

8<sup>TH</sup> LEAST STRESSED CITY IN AMERICA – SMART ASSET

#### **2013**

9<sup>TH</sup> SMARTEST CITY IN AMERICA – LUMOSITY

6<sup>TH</sup> BEST PLACE FOR WORK-LIFE BALANCE – NERD WALLET

### **Metrics**

The Economic Development Corporation of Lawrence and Douglas County does not have any published metrics.

### **Entrepreneurship**

The Bioscience & Technology Business Center and the University of Kansas (KU) works with high-potential companies in medical and life sciences; software and hardware; energy and chemicals as well as other innovations. Offerings of the business center include specialized lab space and value-added business services.<sup>89</sup>

The Catalyst is a partnership between the KU Business School and the Bioscience & Technology Business Center. The program provides co-working space, mentoring, prototyping and access to capital for participants.<sup>90</sup>

### **Product Development**

Lawrence Venture Park is 200-acre business park that is located on a former nitrogen plant facility. The City of Lawrence budgeted \$9.5 million for remediation and development of the new park.<sup>91</sup> The master plan of the redeveloped park includes walking trails and pedestrian access within the park as well as with adjacent developments.<sup>92</sup>



### **Tree Preservation**

It does not appear that Lawrence has an urban forester on the city staff.

### **Permitting**

Most construction projects in Lawrence require a building permit. The City's Development Services website provides several checklists ranging from the pre-application meeting to obtaining certificate of occupancy. <sup>93</sup>



## ENDNOTES

- <sup>1</sup> <http://www.fayetteville-ar.com/chamber-team.html>
- <sup>2</sup> <http://www.uark.edu/ua/artp/partnering.html>
- <sup>3</sup> <http://www.uark.edu/ua/artp/ata glance.html>
- <sup>4</sup> <http://www.startupjunkieconsulting.com/what-we-do/>
- <sup>5</sup> <http://www.arkansasbusiness.com/article/105245/hayseed-ventures-aiming-for-6-million-investment>
- <sup>6</sup> <http://www.hayseedventures.com/#about>
- <sup>7</sup> <http://www.nwabusinessjournal.com/14866/center-of-it-all-innovation-hub-makes-its-way-to-fayetteville-square>
- <sup>8</sup> <http://www.starcommunities.org/certification/>
- <sup>9</sup> <http://www.fayetteville-ar.gov/1201/Find-Green-Buildings>
- <sup>10</sup> Esri, Business Analyst Online
- <sup>11</sup> <https://www.unca.edu/facts-and-figures>
- <sup>12</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Departments/EconomicDevelopment/Partnerships.aspx>
- <sup>13</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Portals/0/city-documents/economicdevelopment/Contact%20Us.pdf>
- <sup>14</sup> <http://www.ashevillechamber.org/contact>
- <sup>15</sup> <http://www.citizen-times.com/story/news/local/2015/11/10/chamber-commerce-group-get-asheville-tax-money/75511370/>
- <sup>16</sup> <http://www.ashevilledowntown.org/about-us>
- <sup>17</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Portals/0/city-documents/sustainability/Planning%20incentives%20new%20marketing%20packet.pdf>
- <sup>18</sup> <ftp://ftp.ashevillenc.gov/OED/CommAndEconDevIncentives/KeyReadingforCreativeEconDevConsulting/City%20of%20Asheville%20All%20Development%20Incentives%204-15-13.pdf>
- <sup>19</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Portals/0/city-documents/economicdevelopment/IncentivePolicy.pdf>
- <sup>20</sup> <http://www.ashevillechamber.org/sites/all/themes/chamber/asheville-5x5/documents/EDC5x5-Investor-Report-2015-June-web.pdf>
- <sup>21</sup> <http://ventureasheville.com/elevate/>
- <sup>22</sup> <http://ventureasheville.com/angel-investors/>
- <sup>23</sup> <http://ventureasheville.com/>
- <sup>24</sup> <http://www.riverartsdistrict.com/>
- <sup>25</sup> <http://www.npr.org/sections/thesalt/2014/05/28/316317087/big-breweries-move-into-small-beer-town-and-business-is-hopping>
- <sup>26</sup> <http://www.ashevillechamber.org/welcomehome>
- <sup>27</sup> <http://www.npr.org/sections/thesalt/2014/05/28/316317087/big-breweries-move-into-small-beer-town-and-business-is-hopping>
- <sup>28</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Departments/Sustainability.aspx>
- <sup>29</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Departments/Sustainability/SustainabilityResources.aspx>
- <sup>30</sup> <http://www.ashevillenc.gov/Departments/CityClerk/BoardsCommissions/TreeCommission.aspx>
- <sup>31</sup> Esri, Business Analyst Online
- <sup>32</sup> <http://www.colorado.edu/catalog/2012-13/information/intro>
- <sup>33</sup> <https://bouldercolorado.gov/business/economic-vitality>
- <sup>34</sup> <https://bouldercolorado.gov/business/economic-vitality-contacts>
- <sup>35</sup> <http://bouldereconomiccouncil.org/about-the-bec/staff/>
- <sup>36</sup> [https://www-static.bouldercolorado.gov/docs/2015\\_Recommended\\_Budget\\_v1\\_-\\_For\\_Online-1-201409081713.pdf](https://www-static.bouldercolorado.gov/docs/2015_Recommended_Budget_v1_-_For_Online-1-201409081713.pdf)
- <sup>37</sup> <http://www.boulderdowntown.com/about/bid-and-dbi-compared>
- <sup>38</sup> <https://bouldercolorado.gov/pages/flexible-rebate-program>
- <sup>39</sup> <http://www.siliconflatirons.com/initiatives.php?id=entrep>
- <sup>40</sup> <http://www.techstars.com/>
- <sup>41</sup> <http://bouldereconomiccouncil.org/boulder-economy/innovation-economy/#entrepreneurial-ecosystem>
- <sup>42</sup> <https://bouldercolorado.gov/pages/microloan-program>
- <sup>43</sup> <http://sparkboulder.com/coworking/>
- <sup>44</sup> <http://dcinno.streetwise.co/2015/11/16/top-cities-for-millennials/>



45 <http://dcinno.streetwise.co/2015/11/16/top-cities-for-millennials/>

46 <https://bouldercolorado.gov/planning>

47 [https://www.municode.com/library/co/boulder/codes/municipal\\_code?nodeId=TIT6HESASA\\_CH3TRRECO\\_6-3-13PROWRERECOCO](https://www.municode.com/library/co/boulder/codes/municipal_code?nodeId=TIT6HESASA_CH3TRRECO_6-3-13PROWRERECOCO)

48 <https://bouldercolorado.gov/parks-rec/urban-forestry>

49 <https://bouldercolorado.gov/plan-develop/building-permit-review-process>

50 <https://bouldercolorado.gov/plan-develop/permit-status-report>

51 Esri, Business Analyst Online

52 <http://www.unc.edu/about/>

53 <http://growinorangenc.com/>

54 [http://www.orangecountync.gov/document\\_center/Finance/1419\\_approved\\_cip.pdf](http://www.orangecountync.gov/document_center/Finance/1419_approved_cip.pdf)

55 <http://www.townofchapelhill.org/town-hall/departments-services/economic-development>

56 <http://www.downtownchapelhill.com/about-chdp/>

57 <http://growinorangenc.com/news/orange-county-revolving-loan-program/>

58 <http://campus-y.unc.edu/incubator>

59 <http://www.launchchapelhill.com/program-overview/>

60 <http://1789venturelab.com/>

61 <http://renci.org/about/>

62 <http://growinorangenc.com/news/business-investment-grant-program/>

63 <http://www.townofchapelhill.org/town-hall/departments-services/planning-and-sustainability/permits-and-inspections>

64 <http://www.townofchapelhill.org/home/showdocument?id=31063>

65 Esri, Business Analyst Online

66 <http://www.colostate.edu/>

67 <http://www.fcgov.com/business/>

68 <https://fortcollinschamber.com/business-advocacy/economic-development/>

69 [http://www.reporterherald.com/business-top-stories/ci\\_29003436/northern-colorado-economic-groups-merger-set](http://www.reporterherald.com/business-top-stories/ci_29003436/northern-colorado-economic-groups-merger-set)

70 <http://www.northerncolorado.com/#about-us>

71 [http://www.denverpost.com/ci\\_27804470/third-jobs-group-may-boost-northern-colorado-growth](http://www.denverpost.com/ci_27804470/third-jobs-group-may-boost-northern-colorado-growth)

72 <http://downtownfortcollins.com/?/about/downtown-business-association/>

73 <http://www.fcgov.com/business/target-industries.php>

74 <http://www.innosphere.org/index.asp>

75 <http://www.innosphere.org/Page.asp?NavID=14>

76 <http://biz.colostate.edu/IE/Programs/Pages/CSUHatchery.aspx>

77 <http://www.fcgov.com/sustainability/>

78 <http://www.fcgov.com/sustainability/>

79 <http://www.fcgov.com/forestry/>

80 <http://www.fcgov.com/building/fees.php>

81 <http://www.fcgov.com/building/>

82 <http://www.fcgov.com/development/>

83 Esri, Business Analyst Online

84 <https://www.ku.edu/about/>

85 <http://www.edclawrence.com/about-us/our-services/>

86 [https://www.lawrenceks.org/assets/budget/2016/2016\\_recommended\\_budget.pdf](https://www.lawrenceks.org/assets/budget/2016/2016_recommended_budget.pdf)

87 <http://www.downtownlawrence.com/about-us/>

88 <https://www.lawrenceks.org/assets/ecodev/pdf/Lawrence-Summary-of-ED-Incentives-7-11-12.pdf>

89 <http://btbcku.com/what-we-do/>

90 <http://btbcku.com/what-we-do/>





---

<sup>91</sup> <http://www2.ijworld.com/news/2013/oct/04/lawrence-venturepark-proposed-new-name-business-pa/>

<sup>92</sup> <http://lawrenceks.org/lawrenceventurepark>

<sup>93</sup> [https://www.lawrenceks.org/pds/commercial\\_permits](https://www.lawrenceks.org/pds/commercial_permits)